Art & Architectural Review Board: 2016-2018

DEPARTMENT OF GENERAL SERVICES

Serving Government. Serving Virginians.

Submitted: October 1, 2018

Submitted by: Burt Pinnock, Chair, Art and Architectural Review Board

Prepared by: Department of General Services

Table of Contents

Authority 1
Membership 2
Role of the Department of General Services 2
Meeting Information 2
Project Submissions 3
AARB Project Review: Fiscal Year 2016 3
AARB Project Review: Fiscal Year 2017 3
AARB Project Review: Fiscal Year 2018 4
AARB Project Review: Overall Analysis 6
1. Effective Use of the Consent Agenda 6
2. Appropriate Schedule 6
3. Value Added 6
APPENDIX A: Guidelines for Submissions and Presentations

I hereby submit this biennial report for review by the Governor and General Assembly in accordance with Paragraph F., Section 2.2-2400, Code of Virginia.

Signed,

Burt Pinnock, AIA
Chair
Art and Architectural Review Board

Date

Authority

The Art and Architectural Review Board (AARB or the Board) is established by § 2.2-2400 et seq. of the Code of Virginia as an advisory board in the executive branch of government. Executive Order 88 (2001) delegates the Governor's responsibility regarding AARB to the Director of the Department of General Services (DGS).

Membership

According to § 2.2-2400 of the Code of Virginia, the Board is comprised of six members, as follows:

- The Director of the Department of Historic Resources or his/her designee (ex officio)
- Five citizen members appointed by the Governor:
  - An architect nominated by Virginia Society of the American Institute of Architects;
  - A nominee selected by the governing board of the University of Virginia (optional);
  - A member of the Virginia Museum of Fine Arts (VMFA) board of trustees; and
  - Two members appointed from the Commonwealth at large, of which one shall be a painter or sculptor.

Board Membership (fiscal years: July 1-June 30)

2016	2017	2018
Robert Mills, Chair	Robert Mills, Chair	Burt Pinnock, Chair
Burt Pinnock, Vice-Chair	Burt Pinnock, Vice-Chair	Helen Wilson, Vice-Chair
Calder Loth, DHR representative	Calder Loth, DHR representative	Calder Loth, DHR representative
Sanford Bond	Sanford Bond	Ian Vaughn*
Helen Wilson	Helen Wilson	Tom Papa*
Donna Tuten	Donna Tuten	Lindsey Brittain*

***Denotes new appointments September 2018**

Role of the Department of General Services

In accordance with § 2.2-2400, Code of Virginia, the Department of General Services' provides assistance to the Board in the undertaking of its responsibilities. On a monthly basis, this includes coordinating the meeting agendas, receiving and preparing submissions for review, scheduling and staffing the meetings, and producing meeting minutes for distribution.

Meeting Information

Meeting dates, locations, agendas, and minutes are listed on the AARB page on the DGS website: www.dgs.virginia.gov/DivisionofEngineeringandBuildings/DirectorsOffice/AARB.

Questions or comments concerning the AARB may be submitted to the DGS Directors Office: AARB@dgs.virginia.gov, or (804) 786-4361.

Project Submissions

Submissions must comply with DGS-issued Guidelines for Submittals and Presentations, available on the DGS website (listed above), and attached hereto as Appendix A.

At the discretion of the Board Chair, the following submissions may be placed on the Consent Agenda (and do not require agency representation at the meeting): (i) projects of a small-scale with clear and well-documented scope of work, or (ii) demolitions that also require DHR review.

AARB Project Review: Fiscal Year 2016

Table 1: Fiscal Year 2016

	Consent Agenda		Project Agenda		TOTAL	
Month	**# of Projects**	**# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes**	**# of Projects**	**# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes**	**# of Projects**	**# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes**
Jul-15	4	0	5	5	9	5
Aug-15	10	0	4	3	14	3
Sep-15	8	0	5	2	13	2
Oct-15	3	0	5	3	8	3
Nov-15	6	0	11	6	17	6
Dec-15	9	0	1	0	10	0
Jan-16	4	0	7	5	11	5
Feb-16	5	0	2	2	7	2
Mar-16	8	0	5	5	13	5
Apr-16	12	0	6	4	18	4
May-16	7	0	10	6	17	6
Jun-16	7	0	3	0	10	0
Monthly Avgs	**6.9**	**0**	**5.3**	**3.4**	**12.3**	**3.4**
TOTALS	**83**	**0**	**64**	**41**	**147**	**41**

AARB Project Review: Fiscal Year 2017

Table 2: Fiscal Year 2017

	Consent Agenda		Project Agenda		TOTAL	
Month	**# of Projects**	**# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes**	**# of Projects**	**# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes**	**# of Projects**	**# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes**
Jul-16	10	0	1	1	11	1
Aug-16	7	0	3	1	10	1
Sep-16	7	0	2	2	9	2
Oct-16	10	0	4	4	14	4
Nov-16	10	0	3	3	13	3
Dec-16	10	0	3	3	13	3
Jan-17	5	1	3	3	8	4
Feb-17	6	0	4	3	10	3
Mar-17	7	0	9	7	16	7
Apr-17	11	0	2	2	13	2
May-17	9	0	4	4	13	4
Jun-17	2	0	2	2	4	2
Monthly Avgs	**7.8**	**0.08**	**3.3**	**2.9**	**11.2**	**3.0**
TOTALS	**94**	**1**	**40**	**35**	**134**	**36**

AARB Project Review: Fiscal Year 2018

Table 3: Fiscal Year 2018

	Consent Agenda		Project Agenda		TOTAL	
Month	**# of Projects**	**# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes**	**# of Projects**	**# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes**	**# of Projects**	**# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes**
Jul-17	12	0	8	7	20	7
Aug-17	9	0	3	3	12	3
Sep-17	5	0	4	4	9	4
Oct-17	9	0	7	5	16	5
Nov-17	7	0	6	2	13	2
Dec-17	9	2	5	5	14	7
Jan-18	9	0	4	3	13	3
Feb-18	7	0	2	2	9	2
Mar-18	12	0	9	7	21	7
Apr-18	10	0	2	2	12	2
May-18	8	0	5	5	13	5
Jun-18	9	0	3	3	12	3
Monthly Avgs	**8.8**	**0.17**	**4.8**	**4.0**	**13.67**	**4.2**
TOTALS	**106**	**2**	**58**	**48**	**164**	**50**

AARB Project Review: Overall Analysis

Table 4: Three Year Totals

	Consent Agenda			Project Agenda			TOTAL		
Fiscal Year	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes	% of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes	% of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes	# of Projects	# of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes	% of Projects to which AARB Recommended Changes
2016	83	0	0%	64	41	67.2%	147	41	27.8%
2017	94	1	.01%	40	35	87.5%	134	36	26.9%
2018	106	2	.02%	58	48	82.7%	164	50	30.5%
TOTALS	**283**	**3**	**.01%**	**162**	**124**	**76.5%**	**445**	**127**	**28.5%**
AVERAGES	94.3	1	.01%	54	41.3	79.1%	148	42	28.4%

1. Use of the Consent Agenda

As reflected in Table 5, below, 283 projects, or more than half of all projects from 2016-2018, were placed on the Consent Agenda. Of those, the Board recommended changes to only three projects (.01 percent). Consent Agenda projects do not require agency representation at the monthly meetings, maximizing placement on this agenda enables Board review in an efficient way that minimizes expenditure of agency resources.

Table 5: Allocation of Projects Between Consent and Project Agenda

	2016	**2017**	**2018**	**Average**
% of Projects on the Consent Agenda	56%	70%	65%	**64%**
% of Projects on the Project Agenda	44%	30%	35%	**36%**

2. Schedule

The average number of projects reviewed per monthly meeting was 12.3 for FY 2016, 11.2 for FY 2017 and 13.7 FY 2018. Monthly meetings on a consistent schedule support the agencies' need for timely submission and review to support project progress.

3. Value Added

Of the 445 projects submitted for Board review from 2016-2018, the Board provided comments on 127 projects, or nearly 29 percent of all projects reviewed by the Board. Of these 127 projects, the Board did not overturn any projects.

VIRGINIA ART AND ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD (AARB)

AGENCY GUIDELINES FOR SUBMISSIONS AND PRESENTATIONS

Revised August 2018

Table of Contents

(Click to go to the subsection)

- 1. Purpose of the AARB 3
- 2. AARB Code of Virginia Authority
  - § 2.2-2400.....4-5
  - § 2.2-2401.....5
  - § 2.2-2402.....5-6
- 3.AARB Board Membership 7
- 4. Meeting Logistics 7
- 5. Submission Logistics 7-8
- 6. Submission Content 8
- 7. Requesting Consent Agenda 8-9
- 8. Presentation Logistics.....9
- 9. Presentation Consent 9-10
- 10. Questions On Submissions.....11

Attachments

- Project Data Sheet 12

DGS Contact information

Contact DGS, if you have any questions, comments or suggestions about this process:
804-786-4361
Preferred method of contact: AARB@dgs.virginia.gov

1. Purpose of the AARB

The AARB consists of five citizen members appointed by the Governor, plus a representative of the Department of Historic Resources, to advise him on the "artistic character" of buildings and works of art which are to be paid for by the state, or to be located on or over state property. In practice, the AARB recommends approval or disapproval to the Director of General Services, to whom the Governor has delegated this authority. Membership criteria are set out in Section 2.1488.1 of the Code of Virginia.

The AARB interprets its mandate from the Commonwealth in straightforward terms: to encourage the design of buildings and works of art which are both aesthetically and functionally appropriate to the agency for which they are intended. While no rigid prescriptive standards exist, the AARB generally requires each submission to demonstrate:

- A resolution of basic functional and organizational requirements.
- A command of the fundamental principles of good design, including refinement of color, form, scale, material, and craft.
- A positive contribution to the order and aesthetic of the physical setting.
- Due consideration of its environmental, historical, and cultural factors.
- Concerns for the greater public good.

2. Authority granted to the AARB by the Code of Virginia

Section 2.2-2400: Art and Architectural Review Board; members and officers; travel expenses; quorum; compensation; staff; report.

A. The Art and Architectural Review Board (the Board) is established as an advisory board, within the meaning of § 2.2-2100, in the executive branch of state government. The Board shall consist of six members as follows: the Director of the Department of Historic Resources, or his designee, serving as an ex officio member and five citizen members, appointed by the Governor. Of the citizen members, one shall be an architect who may be appointed from a list of two or more architects nominated by the governing board of the Virginia Society of the American Institute of Architects; one may be appointed from a list of two or more persons nominated by the governing board of the University of Virginia; one shall be a member of the board of trustees of the Virginia Museum of Fine Arts; and two shall be appointed from the Commonwealth at large, one of whom shall be a painter or sculptor. Lists of nominees shall be submitted at least 60 days before the expiration of the member's term for which the nominations are being made in order to be considered by the Governor in making appointments pursuant to this section.

B. Beginning July 1, 2011, the Governor's appointments of the five citizen members shall be staggered as follows: two members for a term of one year, two members for a term of two years, and one member for a term of three years. Thereafter, members of the Board shall be appointed for terms of four years each, except appointments to fill vacancies, which shall be for the unexpired terms. No member shall serve for more than two consecutive four-year terms, except that any member appointed to the unexpired term of another shall be eligible to serve two consecutive four-year terms. Vacancies shall be filled in the manner of the original appointments. The Director of the Department of Historic Resources shall serve a term coincident with his term of office.

C. Annually, the Board shall elect a chairman and vice-chairman and may elect such other officers as the Board deems proper from among its membership. A majority of the members of the Board shall constitute a quorum.

D. The members of the Board shall serve without compensation, but shall be reimbursed for all reasonable and necessary expenses incurred in the discharge of their duties as provided in § 2.2-2825.

E. The Department of General Services shall provide assistance to the Board in the undertaking of its responsibilities.

F. The Board shall submit a biennial report to the Governor and General Assembly on or before October 1 of each even-numbered year.

Section 2.2-2401: Works of art accepted by Governor; approval by Board; meaning of "work of art"

A. The Governor may accept, in the name of the Commonwealth, gifts to the Commonwealth of works of art as defined in subsection B. But no work of art shall be so accepted until submitted to the Board or otherwise brought to its attention for its advice and counsel to the Governor.

B. As used in this article, "work of art" means all paintings, mural decorations, stained glass, statues, bas-reliefs, tablets, sculptures, monuments, fountains, arches or other structure of a permanent character intended for ornament or commemoration.

Section 2.2-2402: Governor's approval of works of art; removal, etc.; structures, fixtures and works of art placed on or extending over state property.

A. No work of art shall become the property of the Commonwealth by purchase, gift or otherwise, unless the work of art or a design thereof, together with its proposed location, have been submitted to and approved by the Governor acting with the advice and counsel of the Board. Nor shall any work of art, until so submitted and approved, be contracted for, placed in or upon or allowed to extend over any property belonging to the Commonwealth. No existing work of art owned by the Commonwealth shall be removed, relocated or altered in any way without submission to the Governor.

This subsection shall not apply to any portrait, tablet or work of art portraying, or pertaining to, a present or former Governor and presented to, or acquired, by the Governor and displayed in that part of the building under the direct supervision of the Governor or a present or former presiding officer of the Senate or a member or former member of the Supreme Court, the Senate, or the House of Delegates, presented to, or acquired by, the member's or presiding officer's respective body and displayed in that part of any building under the direct supervision and jurisdiction of such body nor shall they apply to any portrait, tablet or work of art acquired by the Virginia Museum of Fine Arts or museums operated in conjunction with art or architectural departments at public colleges or universities in Virginia.

B. No construction or erection of any building or any appurtenant structure of any nature, which is to be placed on or allowed to extend over any property belonging to the Commonwealth, and no construction or erection of any bridge, arch, gate, fence, or other structure or fixture intended primarily for ornamental or memorial purposes, and which

is to be paid for, either wholly or in part by appropriation from the state treasury, and, which is to be placed on or allowed to extend over any property belonging to the Commonwealth, shall be begun, unless the design and proposed location thereof have been submitted to the Governor and its artistic character approved in writing by him acting with the advice and counsel of the Board, unless the Governor has failed to disapprove in writing the design within thirty days after its submission. No existing structure of the kinds described in this subsection, owned by the Commonwealth, shall be removed, remodeled or added to, nor shall any appurtenant structure be attached without submission to the Governor and the artistic character of the proposed new structure approved in writing by him acting with the advice and counsel of the Board, unless the Governor has failed to disapprove in writing the design within thirty days after its submission.

C. No work of art not owned by the Commonwealth shall be placed in or upon or allowed to extend over any property belonging to the Commonwealth for a period of more than two years unless such work of art or a design thereof has been submitted to and approved by the Governor acting with the advice and counsel of the Board.

This subsection shall not apply to the Virginia Museum of Fine Arts or museums operated in conjunction with art or architectural departments at public colleges and universities in Virginia.

3. AARB Board Membership

Five citizen members shall be staggered as follows: two members for a term of one year, two members for a term of two years, and one member for a term of three years. (see DGS website for current membership). Thereafter, members of the Board shall be appointed for terms of four years each, except appointments to fill vacancies, which shall be for the unexpired terms. No member shall serve for more than two consecutive four-year terms, except that any member appointed to the unexpired term of another shall be eligible to serve two consecutive four-year terms. Vacancies shall be filled in the manner of the original appointments. The Director of the Department of Historic Resources shall serve a term coincident with his term of office.

4. Meeting Logistics

a. Agenda: Available on the DGS website the week-of the scheduled meeting

b. Dates: Generally, meetings are held on **the first Friday of every month at 10:00am**
Meetings dates are subject to change to accommodate state holidays and Board attendance, please refer to the DGS website to confirm the next meeting date

c. Location: Please refer to the DGS website to confirm the current meeting location

5. Submission Logistics

Submit the following information to AARB@dgs.virginia.gov by **3:00pm on the Friday** two weeks prior to the meeting date**:**

Note: Recommendation by DGS to seek Board review when you have fair certainty of the exterior appearance of the facility, location, overall massing, materials, colors, landscaping, etc. For capital outlay projects, this is often at the fully-developed Schematic or early Preliminary phase. This includes permanent fencing.

a. What to send:

- The Project Data Sheet must be complete and included as the first page (Attachment A)

- All materials and submission content explained below related to a single project must be submitted as one single PDF attachment (in $8^{1/2}$ x 11 or 11 x 17 Adobe PDF file format)
- Any cover letter or related correspondence should appear in the body of the email and be submitted as one complete document.
- All submissions must include the agency contact in the email distribution

b. Required format for naming of submissions:

- File Name: AARB_Year_Month_Agency Name_Project Name
- Email Subject Line: AARB_Agency Name_Project Name
-

6. Submission Content

a. Required: a completed Project Data Sheet

b. Recommended: In addition to the Project Data Sheet (and submitted with it as part of a single PDF document), the submission should include visuals showing:

- Location and site plans
- Building and/or landscape design,
- Site (to establish architecture, landscape and/or historic context)
- Materials
- *See Presentation Content section for additional information*

7. Requesting the Consent Agenda

a. The Consent Agenda which can be approved in one action, rather than filing motions on each item separately, is used to review:

- Small-scale projects that have a clear and well-documented scope of work
- Demolitions that are also required to undergo DHR review

b. How to request Consent Agenda consideration:

- Indicate on the Project Data Sheet if you are requesting Consent Agenda consideration

- The Board Chair decides if there is sufficient information for an item to appear on the Consent Agenda (please check the Meeting Agenda on the DGS Website to confirm)

- Typically, Consent Agenda items do not require Agency attendance at AARB meetings *(please check the Meeting Agenda on the DGS Website to confirm)*

8. Presentation Logistics

a. DGS Provides for the Agency presenting:
- All project materials included in the Agency electronic submission
- Laptop
- Projector
- Screen

b. Bring (if applicable):
- Any updated or supplementary presentation materials: please put on a flash drive or USB (no paper handouts).
  NOTE: please email supplementary/updated materials presented at the meeting to AARB@dgs.virginia.gov
- Physical samples of materials (i.e. samples of brick, glass, paneling, etc.)

c. Length of Presentation:
- Indicate time needed on the Project Data Sheet
- Commensurate with the complexity of project not to exceed 15 minutes.

9. Presentation Content

a. Presentations should be organized and well prepared but not be elaborate or overly formal. Explain the project using clear, simple exhibits and a concise narrative.

b. For initial presentations on a project:
- Use: Indicate the use of the building (i.e. classroom, library, laboratory, dormitory, etc.)

- Context: Show photographs and illustrations that establish the context of the project, with particular attention to those architecture and landscape features that contribute to the identity of the institution or site. Indicate the relationship of the project to the surrounding community, historic significance, adjacent sites, and agency master plan.

- Mass, Scale, Form and Architectural Character: Discuss the impact of the proposed design on existing views and the mass and scale of nearby structures. Exhibits should

clearly differentiate between existing and proposed projects. Explain how the proposed design conforms to the architectural and planning principles embodied in the master plan or in precedent examples. Describe and illustrate proposed materials, colors, finishes and details. Include a brief description of the proposed site development, including grading, site drainage, paving, lighting, plant material and site furniture (ex: benches). Include discussion of land use policy, pedestrian and vehicular circulation systems, landforms, and architectural character

c. For return presentations on the same project:
   - State when previous presentation(s) were made on the project
   - Restate previous Board comments
   - Briefly review project
   - Show actions taken to address Board comments; use visuals to compare previous renderings with updates

10.Questions On Submissions?

If you are not sure if Board review is necessary, please email AARB@dgs.virginia.gov

ART AND ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD (AARB)

Project Data Sheet

Revised 2018

(Due two weeks before meeting to: AARB@dgs.virginia.gov)

Date Submitted:

Agency Name:

Project Name and Number
(Include project name, number/code and location, i.e. city, county, etc.)

Representatives for the Agency and the Architect/Engineer
(Include names, titles, phone numbers—including contact information for the day-of the meeting, email, address)

Current Project Status/Phase and Schedule Preview: ☐ Final Consent: ☐
(Status/Phase = Schematic, etc. Schedule= next milestone date)

Project Description
(Area, number of stories, building and roof forms, exterior materials, etc.)

Architectural Aesthetic*:*
(What does it look like and why?)

Relationship to Approved Master Plan
(Include date of master plan and how this project relates to a larger program effort, if applicable)

Existing Architectural Context
(The surrounding community, historic significance, adjacent site, the identity of the agency or institution, etc.)

AARB History *(for return presentations on the same project)***:**

- **Meeting date(s) previously presented to Board:**
- **Previous Board comments:**
- **Agency response to Board comments:**

Estimated Time required for the Presentation (not to exceed 15 minutes)

Request for Consent Agenda: Yes: ☐ No: ☐

VIRGINIA ART AND ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD (AARB)
Guidelines for Submissions and Presentations
Revised August 2018