Approved Minutes

Art and Architectural Review Board

January 17, 2025

Patrick Henry Building, West Reading Room

1111 E. Broad Street Richmond, VA 23219

1.0 ADMINISTRATION

10:08 am **1.1** CALL TO ORDER

Board Members Present: Lynden Garland, Chair; Anca Lipan, Vice-Chair; Megan Melinat; Stanley Rayfield; and Jill Nolt.

* A quorum is established.

Board Members Absent: Anne Smith; and Gaby Rengifo.

DGS Staff Present: Kästle Aschliman; Dena Potter, and Kimberly Freiberger.

1.2 PUBLIC COMMENT

AARB Meetings are open for public comment.

Members of the public provided comment for Agenda Item 3.5 – Virginia Museum of Fine Arts Renovation/ Expansion. 2 individuals were in support of the project and 2 individuals were against it. A written public comment letter and the Public Comment Sign-In Sheet are attached as Appendix A and B.

1.3 APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion to Approve: Anca Lipan

Second: Megan Melinat

Vote: 3-Y 0-N, 1 Abs-Jill Nolt [Absent for vote: Stanley Rayfield]

1.4 OTHER BUSINESS

Reminder to all board members to complete the Conflict of Interest Act (COIA) Annual Filing no later than January 3, 2025.

2.0 CONSENT AGENDA

2.1 Virginia Tech / Airport Shop

(Final Approval)

Constructed in 1942, the building was previously known as the Turbo Lab and houses research turbine engines. The existing exterior finishes of the Airport Shop are worn and beyond their useful life. The project proposes exterior envelope improvements including masonry patching and repair, waterproofing sealant coating of the CMU, roofing and select door replacement. The worn and tattered infill of an existing opening will be removed, replaced, and painted to match. One pair of hinged doors will be removed and replaced with an overhead door to match the existing adjacent doors.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR) Comments: DHR has not received this and does not need to review it unless required by another

agency.

Board Comments:

None

Motion to Recommend Final Approval with DHR Comments: Jill Nolt

Second: Anca Lipan Vote: 5-Y 0-N

2.2 Virginia Community College System (VCCS) / Northern Virginia Community College, Demolish Amphitheater

(Final Approval)

This project is located on the NVCC Manassas Campus in Manassas, VA. The scope of work generally includes demolishing the existing amphitheater structure and applicable utilities within the immediate surrounding area as the space no longer serves the needs of the College. Department of Historic Resources (DHR) Comments: DHR has not

received this and will have to review this if demolition permits are needed in accordance with Section V.2 of Division of Engineering and Buildings Directive #1, Revised 1984 (§ 2.2-2402 *Code of Virginia*).

Board Comments:

- None

Motion to Recommend Final Approval with DHR Comments: Jill Nolt

Second: Anca Lipan Vote: 5-Y 0-N

2.3 Department of Behavioral Health and Developmental Services (DBHDS) / Piedmont Geriatric Hospital Boiler Replacement

(Final Approval)

The Virginia Department of Behavioral Health and Developmental Services (DBHDS) currently operates a central boiler plant on its Nottoway County campus, serving the Virginia Center for Behavioral Health (VCBR) and Piedmont Geriatric Hospital (PGH). This plant was originally constructed in 1945 and is comprised of three boilers. This project will replace the existing 200 HP Boiler 3 with a new 400 HP Biomass (Switchgrass) Boiler to meet the additional load required for the recent VCBR expansion project. Boiler 3 replacement is being requisitioned via IFB# 22-01.01, inclusive of ash cyclone systems and baghouse filters (emissions controls). This project will integrate the selected boiler manufacturer's equipment and provide all other infrastructure to support Boiler 3 replacement.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR) Comments: DHR has not received this and does not need to review it unless required by another agency.

Board Comments:

None

Motion to Recommend Final Approval with DHR Comments: Jill Nolt Second: Anca Lipan

Vote: 5-Y 0-N

2.4 Gunston Hall / A/E Services for Gunston Hall Gutters

(Final Approval)

Gunston Hall is the eighteenth-century dwelling built by George Mason IV between 1755 and 1759 on land overlooking the Potomac River on Mason's Neck. The home is a listed National Historic Landmark and is operated as a house museum. Through much of its history, the home has suffered from water infiltration issues in the basement. To address this ongoing issue, a recent study by Glavé & Holmes has recommended the

installation of gutters as a means to address the concentration of water at the base of the foundation. The historical record demonstrates that the home has had gutters and downspouts previously at various points in its history.

This current project will consist of the design of and construction phase services to prepare Working Drawings and Specifications for the installation of gutters on the mansion. The gutter design has been determined utilizing a design approach common to other homes of this era. The gutters will be half-round gutters with roof-mounted brackets and are planned for the primary horizontal eave on the East and West sides of the Mansion. Drainage will include round gutters mounted to the masonry façade and piped to underground piping to allow the water to discharge on-site a sufficient distance away from the mansion for drainage.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR) Comments: DHR has not received this and will have to review this in accordance with the Appropriations Act (Biennial Budget Bill).

Board Comments:

None

Motion to Recommend Final Approval with DHR Comments: Jill Nolt

Second: Anca Lipan Vote: 5-Y 0-N

3.0 PROJECT REVIEWS

3.1 Virginia Tech / New Business Building

(Final Approval)

The Pamplin College of Business (PCOB) is nationally recognized for its business programs and is integral to Virginia Tech's delivery of instruction and research programming in support of the Commonwealth. The New Business Building project will provide a consolidated location for the college, allowing the college to amplify program impact, as well as couple with the Data and Decision Sciences building to complete the academic facilities of the Global Business and Analytics Complex (GBAC). Envisioned as a four-story structure at approximately 93,000 gross square that will connect with Data and Decision Sciences (D&DS) to provide expanded, modern, and educational space.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR): DHR has reviewed this project and no historical resources will be adversely impacted by this project.

Board Comments:

 Consider the use of curves in the ADA ramp and sidewalk installation as the space and budget will allow.

Motion to Recommend Approval with Board comments: Jill Nolt

Second: Anca Lipan Vote: 5-Y 0-N

3.2 James Madison University / Johnston Hall Renovation and Addition (Final Approval)

This renovation and addition project includes the renovation of the existing three-story 20,000 SF Johnston Hall and proposes a new two-story 14,000 SF addition. The massing and design of the addition will be in keeping with the architectural character of Johnston Hall and JMU's adjacent Bluestone buildings. Exterior materials include a predominately bluestone facade with aluminum-clad wood windows and a clay tile roof.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR): DHR has reviewed and offers the following comments:

Based on the submitted material, the plans largely adhere to the Standards, and we recommend that the project will not adversely impact historical resources provided certain conditions, as follows:

- 1. JMU will submit to DHR architectural working drawings, finish details, and product cut sheets for exterior elements only (i.e. windows, doors, trim, railing, masonry, and roofing), as they become available for our records to ensure consistency with the design as currently proposed. DHR comments are not required unless there is a substantial change in the project scope; and
- If the scope of work changes and/or the project cannot be executed as presented to DHR, then DHR consultation will be reopened.

Board Comments:

- Continue to study how the new building integrates with the existing plaza.
- DHR has outlined 2 conditions to follow as this project is executed. Continue to follow the DHR directives.

Motion to Recommend Approval with Board comments: Anca Lipan Second: Stanley Rayfield

Vote: 5-Y 0-N

3.3 University of Virginia / Ivy Corridor Student Housing

(Preliminary Approval)

The University of Virginia is reimagining the student residential experience with the Ivy Corridor Student Housing Project, which will provide 750 to 800 apartment-style beds situated in the heart of a new mixed-use academic and arts district. Each apartment will feature private bedrooms, bathrooms, fully equipped kitchens, and shared living and dining spaces, designed to create a welcoming and community-centered environment. Enhancing the student experience further, the buildings will include common areas such as study

spaces, lounges, and inviting lobbies, fostering interaction and a sense of belonging among residents.

Situated at a prominent gateway to UVA, this project is envisioned as a key element in a vibrant, interconnected university district. The design complements nearby landmarks, including the Karsh Institute of Democracy, the Virginia Guesthouse Hotel and Conference Center, and the recently completed School of Data Science, harmonizing with UVA's architectural and cultural identity.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR): DHR received the Environmental Impacts Report associated with this project and will have comments out by January 16, 2025.

Board Comments:

- Recommend further study of the exterior façade outside of the courtyard.
- Provide more views and renderings at the pedestrian level and student perspectives.
- Provide details and elevations that zoom in to show the detailing of the brick and its patterning throughout the building.
- Provide samples of building materials at final approval.

Motion to Recommend Approval with Board comments: Anca Lipan

Second: Megan Melinat

Vote: 4-Y 0-N, Recusal – Jill Nolt

3.4 University of Virginia / North Grounds Parking Garage

(Final Approval)

Located near the intersection of Massie and Copeley Roads, the North Grounds Parking Garage will be a 6-level, 1,030-space garage built to address parking demand for John Paul Jones (JPJ) Arena and Athletic events as well as UVA commuters. In addition to providing parking, the garage will serve multiple University Transit Service (UTS) routes, bus patrons, and commuters with a multi-modal transit hub that supports micromobility. The garage will sit back from Massie Road to allow for a dynamic landscape that will serve pedestrians, bus patrons, JPJ, and Athletic events.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR): DHR has reviewed and no historic resources will be adversely impacted by this project.

Board Comments:

- None

Motion to Recommend Approval: Stanley Rayfield

Second: Anca Lipan

Vote: 4-Y 0-N, Recusal – Jill Nolt

3.5 Virginia Museum of Fine Arts / Renovation and Expansion

(Final Approval)

The Virginia Museum of Fine Arts Expansion and Renovation consists of 173,700gsf of new construction and 45,000sf of renovation as mandated by Legislative Intent. The Expansion (new construction) has been located at the

southwest corner of the existing museum adjacent to the 1985 wing as a means to avoid adversely affecting the original 1936 wing and to minimize disruption to the 2010 expansion including the front entry and drop-off. The proposed expansion will have one level below grade, (5) primary levels above grade and a fully architecturally screened penthouse. Exterior facades are comprised of a blend of flat and concave/fluted insulated glass (both clear and fritted), perforated aluminum brise-soleils, and concave/fluted pre-cast panels.

Roof materials will be Inverted Roof Membrane Assemblies (IRMA) where not visible or occupiable (to properly contain elevated interior humidity levels) and public exterior terraces with pavers and plantings. Per code interpretation guidance from the Division of Engineering and Buildings (DEB), the expansion will need to create a new vertical fire barrier between it and the rest of the 1985 wing. This code determination will require the

demolition of an existing elevated terrace (not accessible to the public), windowless perimeter wall, and glass-enclosed stairs of the 1985 wing to create a fully vertical demising line and separation between existing and new construction. This firewall guidance also precludes any upper levels of the expansion from being set back and

cantilevering eastward over existing to remain 1985 space. Further, the assessed water table precludes additional basement levels.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR): No status change since the December 2024 AARB meeting when DHR provided the following comments, "DHR is in active consultation regarding this project. The VMFA renovation and expansion project will have adverse impacts on historic resources." A Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) is being drafted to address the adverse impacts.

Board Comments:

- Study and refine the 5th floor to vary the dimensions of the outdoor space to make it more dynamic and mitigate the sun and possible heat gain.
- Continue consultation with the Department of Historic Resources (DHR).
- If there are any significant changes to the building exterior or site during the value management process, resubmit those changes to the board for review and approval.

Motion to Recommend Approval with Board comments: Stanley Rayfield

Second: Jill Nolt

Vote: 4-Y 0-N, 1 Abs - Lynden Garland

4.0 ANNOUNCEMENTS

The next AARB meeting will be held on Friday, February 7, 2025.

5.0 MEETING ADJOURNED - 2:58 pm

5.1 APPENDICES: APPENDIX A and B

APPENDIX A

Art and Architectural Review Board January 10, 2025 Meeting

COMMENT - AGENDA ITEM 3.5

I urge the Board members to stick to their previous decision and continue to recommend denial of the proposed VMFA Expansion.

The unfortunate truth is that the existing site of the VMFA on Arthur Ashe Boulevard is simply unsuitable for such an enormous expansion. There is obviously no suitable space for another wing or new building on the Museum grounds. The only place within the existing building footprint where a large addition is remotely feasible is the location chosen by the VMFA. However, the addition of a large box on top of the Southwest corner of the Museum will unavoidably do great violence to the existing building's architectural values. It is akin to putting a five story addition on top of the State Capitol building. No matter what cosmetic touches are applied to the design, it will still be a monstrosity.

The VMFA submission fails to satisfy at least three of the applicable criteria:

- A command of the fundamental principles of good design, including refinement of color, form, scale, material, and craft. The scale of the proposed addition violates fundamental principles of good design.
- A positive contribution to the order and aesthetic of the physical setting. The overall aesthetic appeal of the Museum and grounds will be significantly diminished by the proposed addition. After an expenditure of at least \$261 million, the Commonw alth will have a facility that is less pleasing to the eye and aesthetically appealing than the existing Museum and grounds. The contribution of the proposed addition will be negative, not positive. As the Commonwealth's premier artistic institution, it is particularly important that VMFA projects meet the highest design standards.
- Due consideration of its environmental, historical, and cultural factors. The proposed expansion, looming over the nearby 19th and early 20th century structures on Grove Avenue and within the Museum grounds, will be discordant with its immediate physical environment. No superficial features of the design can overcome this problem.

I am under no illusion that disapproval of this submission by the Board will determine the ultimate fate of the proposed VMFA Expansion. Approval or disapproval will be a political decision. But that makes it even more important that the Board preserves its integrity by making its recommendation strictly on the merits.

Submitted by: J. J. Jewett, III Ashland, VA jjewett3@verizon.net

APPENDIX B

ART AND ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD (AARB) PUBLIC COMMENT SIGN-IN SHEET

Patrick Henry Building / West Reading Room

Friday, January 17, 2025

Location:

Date:

•	
Time: 10:00 am	
NAME and PROJECT THAT Y TO MAN IS ALL FGS THUMAS COURTNEY LLC	FOR VMFA EXPANSION VMFA EXPANSION VMFA EXPANSION
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	