

Approved Minutes
Art and Architectural Review Board
October 4, 2024, at 10:00 am
James Monroe Building - Rooms C, D & E
101 North 14th Street, Richmond, VA 23219

1.0 ADMINISTRATION

- 10:10 am **1.1 CALL TO ORDER**
Board Members Present: Lynden Garland, Chair, Anca Lipan, Vice-Chair; Jill Nolt; Gaby Rengifo; Stanley Rayfield and Anne Smith.
Board Members Absent: Megan Melinat.
DGS Staff Present: Kästle Aschliman; and Kimberly Freiburger.
- 1.2 PUBLIC COMMENT**
AARB Meetings are open for public comment. Rules for public comment can be obtained from the Department of General Services.
None
- 1.3 APPROVAL OF MINUTES**
Motion to Approve: Jill Nolt
Second: Stanley Rayfield
Vote: 5-Y 0-N [Absent for vote: Gaby Rengifo]
- 1.4 OTHER BUSINESS**
None

2.0 CONSENT AGENDA

- 2.1 Virginia School for the Deaf and the Blind / Bass Hall Patio Replacement**
(Final Approval)
The intention of this project is to resolve a continual issue with water infiltration at the Bass Hall Plaza, a 2,162 square foot plaza located at the main entrance to the building that houses dormitory space for students. An attempt to correct this problem was constructed most recently in 1989. The solution involved the removal of plaza components down to the suspended 4-inch concrete slab, installation of new waterproofing layers, remediation at existing floor drains, and installation of new concrete pavers on the surface of the plaza. The attempt has not been successful and there is significant water damage to the loggia below from standing water that routinely collects at the plaza level.
Department of Historic Resources (DHR): VSDB is in active consultation with DHR on this project. In our initial comments, we had some concerns regarding the new porch roof that will cover 1,545 sf of the plaza. Bass Hall was constructed in 1965. There is no historical precedent for a covered porch. Historic drawings and additional information were provided to DHR on 10/3/24 and we will have comments issued by 11/2/24.

Other Board Comments: None

Motion to Approve pending resolution of any DHR comments: Anca Lipan

Second: Stanley Rayfield

Vote: 6-Y 0-N

2.2 Department of Behavioral Health and Developmental Services / Catawba Hospital Building 15 & 16 HVAC Replacement

(Final Approval)

The existing Catawba Hospital, Building No. 15, is an existing 8 story building plus basement. The entire structural system, inclusive of all exterior walls, are of cast-in-place construction and encloses 135,695 gross square feet. Its roof consists of a low-slope insulated fully adhered single-ply roof membrane on a cast-in-place roof deck. This project involves to complete HVAC system replacement in both Building No. 15 and Building No. 16. Because of the very shallow floor plate heights of 10'-0" and type of construction there are limited means by which to convey conditioned and code required outside air to the multiple floors. As a result, ductwork serving floor levels adjacent to new or renovated mechanical rooms will be fed by ductwork which extends through existing window openings up and/or down the exterior face of the north elevation in three locations. A fourth location is on the west elevation of the building wing making connection to Building 16. These ducts while extending up/or down the building's façade will be enclosed within a sheet metal enclosure supported by a structural steel frame. The enclosure will be of pre-finished sheet metal of a color to closely match that of the existing building. Additionally, new exhaust fans serving primarily single or multi-user toilet rooms are being provided along the north elevation.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR): The Department has not reviewed this and does not need to review this unless required by another agency.

Other Board Comments: None

Motion to Approve: Anca Lipan

Second: Stanley Rayfield

Vote: 5-Y 0-N; 1-Abstain: Anne Smith

2.3 Virginia Community College System / Virginia Peninsula Community College- Replace Diggs Moore Harrison Complex

(Final Approval)

The proposed building will be a replacement of the existing 1968 era Diggs/ Moore/ Harrison building complex on the Hampton Campus of Virginia Peninsula Community College, with a new 75,000 square foot Administrative and Classroom facility. This new building, located at the front of the Hampton Campus, will play a pivotal role in creating a new public face for Virginia Peninsula Community College from Interstate 64. Seamlessly configured interior-exterior student spaces will reinforce master plan initiatives, making the campus more inviting and collegial. Major instructional programs supported by

the new building are Information Technologies, including a Cyber Lab, and Business and Public Services programs leading directly to employment. Office suites will include the President's suite and Board room and several Vice President's office suites adjacent to the President's suite. The new building will be three stories, maximizing the use of its footprint in contrast to the current one-story structure.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR): The demolitions related to this project resulted in an adverse impact and a Memorandum of Understanding was executed between VCCS and DHR on February 29, 2024. The new construction will not additionally adversely impact historic resources.

Other Board Comments: Due to its size and length of time from previous submission, this project should have been submitted on the regular agenda for final approval. However, the Board is grateful to the Virginia Community College System for providing a thorough presentation to explain changes.

Motion to Approve: Anca Lipan

Second: Stanley Rayfield

Vote: 6-Y 0-N

2.4 Christopher Newport University / Torggler Outdoor Banners

(Final Approval)

Two 80" wide by 180" tall outdoor banners, printed on vinyl, installed nearly flush to the exterior wall, flanking the main entrance of the Torggler Fine Art Center. Banners will advertise current and upcoming exhibits as well as assist in directing visitors to the main entrance and lobby.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR): DHR has not reviewed this and does not need to unless required by another agency.

Other Board Comments: None

Motion to Approve: Anca Lipan

Second: Stanley Rayfield

Vote: 6-Y 0-N

2.5 University of Mary Washington / Campus-wide Accessibility Improvements

(Final Approval)

The UMW's beautiful campus is blessed with a green, rolling landscape and many historic buildings. The University, aware of the challenges that the campus and its buildings present to students and staff with disabilities, has been working to address accessibility issues in its buildings. The scope of the project includes interior renovations to classrooms, site-related improvements, and interior and exterior accessibility to four residence halls on campus. Each of these buildings will receive accessibility improvements to include a new exterior ramp that will connect to the main exterior front portico of each dorm, accessible improvements to selected dorm rooms and associated bathrooms and kitchens as well as elevator additions to the interiors of

three of the buildings: Ball, Westmoreland, and Bushnell. In addition, a new exterior ramp will connect to the rear of Farmer Hall to access the newly renovated space for the Department of Computer Science.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR): DHR has not reviewed this and does not need to unless required by another agency.

Other Board Comments: None

Motion to Approve: Anca Lipan

Second: Stanley Rayfield

Vote: 6-Y 0-N

2.6 Department of Military Affairs / Charlottesville Readiness Center Modernization – Construction HVAC Upgrades

(Final Approval)

The project will remove and replace the existing HVAC systems at the Charlottesville Readiness Center. The project includes the removal and replacement of all existing ductwork and piping, installation of system components designed to prevent the spread of infectious diseases, upgrade the building automation system to include humidity and temperature controls, and zoning of HVAC to reduce potential migration of airborne particles. The project includes all associated architectural component replacements as required. An additive bid item will replace all ceilings affected by the construction.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR): DHR has not reviewed this and does not need to unless required by another agency.

Other Board Comments: None

Motion to Approve: Anca Lipan

Second: Stanley Rayfield

Vote: 6-Y 0-N

2.7 Department of Military Affairs / Danville Readiness Center Modernization – Construction HVAC Upgrades

(Final Approval)

The project will remove and replace the existing HVAC systems at the Danville Readiness Center. The project includes the removal and replacement of all existing ductwork and piping, installation of system components designed to prevent the spread of infectious diseases, upgrade the building automation system to include humidity and temperature controls, and zoning of HVAC to reduce potential migration of airborne particles. The project includes all associated architectural component replacements as required. An additive bid item will replace all ceilings affected by the construction.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR): DHR has not reviewed this and does not need to unless required by another agency.

Other Board Comments: None

Motion to Approve: Anca Lipan
Second: Stanley Rayfield
Vote: 6-Y 0-N

2.8 The College of William and Mary / Stetson Garage Demolition

(Final Approval)

Demolition of a 450-square-foot garage structure that has been abandoned and out of use for decades in a wooded lot that has become overgrown. During previous surveys of the area, the garage was not observable and was believed to have been already demolished.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR): DHR has not reviewed this, and we will need to review it as we are required to review all demolitions.

Other Board Comments: None

Motion to Approve pending resolution of any DHR comments: Anca Lipan
Second: Stanley Rayfield
Vote: 6-Y 0-N

2.9 The College of William and Mary / Campus Living Center Roof Replacement

(Final Approval)

The roof system at 230 Gooch Drive is defective, exhibiting deficiencies in thermal envelope performance and experiencing ongoing issues with water intrusion. This project will replace 10,128SF of existing 5:12 slate roof with new steel shingle panels, factory-formed, interlocking, and stamped to resemble multiple slate shingles. In addition, this project will replace the existing integrated gutter system with a new exterior aluminum gutter system.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR): DHR has not reviewed this and cannot require it unless it is required by another agency. The Campus Living Center is not eligible for individual listing on the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) and Virginia Landmarks Register (VLR). However, it contributes to an expanded VLR/NRHP-eligible William & Mary Historic District. We recommend the shingles get replaced in kind.

Other Board Comments: The Board agrees with the project submission, as submitted, and approves with continued consultation with DHR. The explanation provided by the William and Mary representative clarified that the building is slated for demolition in the masterplan and thus using steel shingle panels instead of slate shingle panels allows for a temporary urgent repair taking into consideration that the building will be demolished in the near future.

Motion to Approve: Anca Lipan
Second: Stanley Rayfield
Vote: 6-Y 0-N

2.10 The College of William and Mary / Griggs Storage Shed Demolition *(Final Approval)*

Demolition of a 70-square-foot brick storage structure (shed) that is in disrepair and has been abandoned.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR) – DHR has not reviewed this, and we will need to review it as we are required to review all demolitions.

Other Board Comments: None

Motion to Approve pending resolution of any DHR comments: Anca Lipan

Second: Stanley Rayfield

Vote: 6-Y 0-N

3.0 PROJECT REVIEWS

3.1 Gunston Hall / Maintenance Building

(Preliminary Approval)

The Maintenance Building was initially planned to be 6,400 SF, with an additional 2,000 SF allocated for outdoor covered storage. Following discussions with the user group, adjustments were made to program spaces to align with the user needs, reducing the building size to 4,000 SF. The outdoor storage space remained at 2,000 SF.

The original scope of the maintenance building included the removal of the existing 2,350 square feet maintenance building and replacement with a new structure. Discussions followed that determined it feasible to utilize the existing building through a renovation and an addition. After receiving direction to return to the original plan, this proposal includes the removal of the existing maintenance building and replacement with a new 4000 sf building with 2000 sf of outdoor storage. The site design includes 2 accessible parking spaces and 3 standard parking spaces for staff. A detailed list of program spaces along with the associated net assignable area for both buildings is provided below.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR): DHR received the archaeology report for this project on 9/17/24 and will have comments out by 10/17/24. We will need to review the architecture as well and we have not yet received it.

Other Board Comments:

- This project submission seeks preliminary approval of the Maintenance Building only. There were changes made to the Maintenance Building, which required resubmission.
- Comments made during the previous submittal concerning the Archaeology Center and other portions of the project should still be addressed as part of the final submission.

- In preparing for final approval, this project will need to be submitted to the Board and DHR for approval on the demolition of the current maintenance building.
- Consider using a different color for the exterior. Suggest using a neutral color so that the building can fade into the natural surrounding area and not play into the storytelling of the other historical buildings on this site that are red.

Motion to Approve with Board Comments and pending resolution of any DHR comments:

Jill Nolt

Second: Gaby Rengifo

Vote: 6-Y 0-N

3.2 Virginia Department of Agriculture and Consumer Services (VDACS) / Harrisonburg Regional Laboratory Addition

(Final Approval)

A single-story addition, approximately 3,300 sf for a new BSL-2 lab at the end of the building, and a single-story addition for a BSL-3 lab in the rear of the building. The BSL-2 lab addition will allow for a new customer drop off and receiving lab space along with the required research lab spaces. The BSL-3 Necropsy lab addition at the rear of the building will utilize the existing BSL-2 Necropsy space as its vestibule to keep efficiency in the required SF. The rear addition is tucked into the corner of the building and will only be visible if someone is on-site at the rear of the building. It will not be visible from the street.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR): DHR has not reviewed this and does not need to unless required by another agency.

Other Board Comments: None

Motion to Approve: Anne Smith

Second: Anca Lipan

Vote: 6-Y 0-N

3.3 Virginia Department of Agriculture and Consumer Services (VDACS) / Warrenton Regional Laboratory Addition

(Final Approval)

A single-story addition, approximately 1,500 sf for a new BSL-2 lab, and a single-story addition for a conference room at the main entrance to the building. The lab addition currently is a single level with an exterior shell designed to allow for a second floor. The lab addition balances the building with a higher roof line similar to the existing necropsy suites at the other end of the building. The conference room addition at the front of the building will be used for training and larger meetings that currently are not accommodated at this location.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR): DHR has not reviewed this and does not need to unless required by another agency.

Other Board Comments:

- Suggestion: Consider further study of the window pattern and proportion.

Motion to Approve with Board Comments: Anne Smith

Second: Gaby Rengifo

Vote: 6-Y 0-N

**3.4 Virginia Department of Agriculture and Consumer Services (VDACS) /
Lynchburg Regional Laboratory Addition**

(Final Approval)

A single-story addition, approximately 1,500 sf with interior renovation for the entry sequence into the existing building. The addition will support a new BSL-2 lab and entrance lobby. The renovation will improve the receiving and administrative functions associated with receiving samples for the labs.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR): DHR has not reviewed this and does not need to unless required by another agency.

Other Board Comments: None

Motion to Approve: Anca Lipan

Second: Stanley Rayfield

Vote: 6-Y 0-N

3.5 Virginia State University / Virginia State University Student Union

(Final Approval)

The VSU Student Union project is centrally located on the Virginia State University campus. The 1.54-acre site is bounded by University Ave. on the East, Boisseau Street on the South, Daniel Gymnasium, and parking lot on the West, and outdoor basketball courts on the North along Stadium Drive.

The building has a two-story volume that includes wellness areas, dance and exercise studios, and an indoor multipurpose basketball court. The exterior material palette includes brick masonry with an architectural precast concrete base. Full-height aluminum curtainwall openings, along with punched window openings, are incorporated to allow natural light to come into the building. A translucent wall system, to reduce glare, will be used on the upper level of the multi-purpose basketball court. The overall vertical fenestration will be less than 30% of the gross above-grade wall area. The roof will be a single-ply membrane with an aluminum panel/framing system to screen rooftop-mounted mechanical equipment.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR): DHR has reviewed this project, and no historic resources will be adversely impacted.

Other Board Comments:

- Highly recommend that more thought be given to the back of the building while setting up the relationship that it will have with other buildings at a future date and time.

- Highly recommend revising the planting plan on the Southwest corner to visually separate the back of house space to the lawn space.
- Reconsider the skewed line of the placement of the building.
- On the south entry consider the color choice of the column whether it is a light color or the red brick.
- Consider the horizontal to continue at the roof.
- Recommend adding in some warmth, more brick, or colors at the south entry to balance out the use of the stand-alone brick column.
- Consider the use of brick or warm colors that can be seen through the glazing.
- If the red brick column is to remain, consider changing the circular seating to brick and consider the color of the soffit.

Motion to Approve with Board Comments: Jill Nolt

Second: Gaby Rengifo

Vote: 6-Y 0-N

3.6 Virginia State University / Improve Access and Accessibility, Johnnella Jackson Hall

~~(Final Approval)~~ *REVISED: Preliminary Approval*

The project consists of a four-story square elevator and stair tower situated halfway between Johnnella Jackson Hall and Lucretia Campbell Hall. Grade from the north & south sidewalks will be sloped at 1:20 or less allowing for ease of ADA entry and avoiding the need for handrails & guardrails. Basement window wells at the east side will be made deeper to accommodate the rising grade. The existing ADA ramp & associated handrails will be removed. A mechanical yard separate from this project is slated to be installed at the Northeast side of the Hall and the new grade will be designed to work around that yard. The tower finishes will be an aluminum-framed curtainwall system and a flat, standing seam metal roof, to differentiate it from the adjacent, existing buildings. The existing main entry porch on the Hall will be removed.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR): VSU has been in active consultation regarding this project. Regarding the base, steps, and ramp, we asked to look at both options without brick and with brick (although the brick should not be in Flemish bond). The pagoda roof is gone as we requested. Submission of the design refinements, as well as a narrative explanation of the changes, should be submitted to DHR.

Other Board Comments:

- Consider further study of the roofline to include the roofline projection and the height to the cornice.
- Incorporate contemporary brick detailing at the entry portal.
- Consider a larger porch to expand the gathering space.
- Consider the use of some solid or translucent panels and glazing on the mechanical yard side.
- Study the type of glazing to be used for heat gain and aesthetics.
- Study the amount and locations of the spandrel banding.
- Consider the additional use of brick into the overall design.
- Review the choice of color for the railing. Consider white.
- Consider the use of the Balustrade as the railing to tie into the existing building.

Motion to Approve with Board Comments and pending resolution of any remaining DHR comments: Anca Lipan
Second: Stanley Rayfield
Vote: 6-Y 0-N

3.7 Virginia State University / Improve Access and Accessibility, President's House; Preplanning

(Final Approval) REVISED: Preliminary Approval

The project consists of an elevator tower addition nestled at the rear elevation of the building and serving the upper 3 floors and possibly the Basement. The elevator itself creates a tower rising to just past the height of the existing primary roof ridge. The lower breakfast room and study will be removed and replaced with an extended flat-roofed single-storied projection that extends the length of the house on the west elevation. The projection will have a central entry and will house the elevator vestibule and first floor ADA restrooms as well as an office to replace the removed study. Two ADA ramps to the elevator vestibule entry will be added, running north/south along the length of the projection with steps leading away from the entry to the west. The flat roof will have a porch with black metal railings, accessible from the second-floor circulation through an existing office space. The existing cross-gabled bay will be mirrored around the elevator tower to replace lost office space and create head room connecting the elevator tower to the offices in the attic of the main roof.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR): VSU has been in active consultation regarding this project. It is DHR's opinion that the elevator additions as proposed will not constitute an adverse impact on historic resources, although we reserve the right to review the final working drawings and any revisions in scope that may occur. If the work cannot be completed as proposed, consultation must be reopened. We further request to see photographs of the brick-and-mortar samples alongside the current buildings as the materials are selected.

Other Board Comments:

- The porch where the brick meets the existing building seems unresolved.
- Consider a cornice at the top of the addition underneath railing.
- Highly recommend making the slanted ramps into ADA ramps with rails.
- Consider eliminating the guardrails on the stairs.
- At final approval submission, provide a more detailed rendering of the area around the building and the landscaping.
- Consider a recessed panel for the window in the chimney.
- Study the use of white railings.
- Review the entry door detailing and general aesthetics.

Motion to Approve with Board comments and pending resolution of any further DHR comments: Anca Lipan
Second: Anne Smith
Vote: 6-Y 0-N

3.8 Virginia State University / Improve Access and Accessibility, Storum Hall; Preplanning

~~(Final Approval)~~ REVISED: Preliminary Approval

The project consists of a three-story elevator tower situated at the east rear side of Storum Hall towards the adjacent parking lot. The tower will house ADA restrooms and an elevator. The tower will be connected to the center rear of Storum Hall via a corridor connector. Access to the elevator tower itself is via a set of stairs from the north sidewalk leading to the first floor of the tower connector. Existing exterior access to the Basement will be maintained through a stair leading under the tower stair first floor landing. The building users wish the building's existing front entrance to be the main entry point and the back stairs used as a secondary entrance. ADA access will be provided at the north elevation via a brick-clad ramp with black-painted steel railings following campus precedent, with one switchback leading to the front porch. The tower finishes will be similar to the adjacent building to remain in context: red brick, cross-gabled standing seam metal roofs, wood cornice with a similar but simplified profile, and aluminum-clad wood windows with similar but differentiating profiles.

A cast stone water table will be included at the tower.

Department of Historic Resources (DHR): VSU has been in active consultation regarding this project and VSU has made multiple rounds of design refinements. The elevator addition for Storum Hall is generally acceptable and our previous comments have been integrated into the current designs. The ramp at Storum follows design precedents for ramps elsewhere in the historic campus core and they have been previously approved by DHR. It is DHR's opinion that the elevator additions as proposed will not constitute an adverse impact on historic resources, although we reserve the right to review the final working drawings and any revisions in scope that may occur. If the work cannot be completed as proposed, consultation must be reopened. We further request to see photographs of the brick-and-mortar samples alongside the current buildings as the materials are selected.

Other Board Comments:

- Consider using white railings.
- Recommend using the segmental arch over windows.
- Clarify what type of brick bonding you will be using.
- Clarify the cornice or PVC entablature detail.
- Consider removing pickets and guardrails to simplify, if landings are under 30 inches.
- Study the double sidewalk at the rear of the building.
- Consider installing a covering at the elevator stair entry and consider the material choice for the stairs at the elevator entry.

Motion to Approve with Board Comments and pending resolution of any further DHR comments: Jill Nolt

Second: Gaby Rengifo

Vote: 6-Y 0-N

3.9 Virginia State University / Provide Conceptual Design Options for New Residential Housing

(Preliminary Approval)

The project consists of new construction for student housing on VSU's campus. The project is a four-story, precast concrete building with thin brick masonry veneer. The residence building will include R-2 occupancy with accessory occupancies of S-2 (storage and mechanical spaces), B (residence life office), and A-3 (multipurpose space).

Department of Historic Resources (DHR): DHR reviewed this project's Environmental Impact Report. The project takes place within the Ettrick Historic District, which is potentially eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) and Virginia Landmarks Register (VLR), and the Campbells Bridge Mill Worker Historic District, which is eligible for listing in the VLR/NRHP. While it appears some of the contributing resources have been previously demolished, there are contributing resources to the Ettrick Historic District within the area of potential effect, and we will need to understand what impacts there will be to those resources specifically. The most recent aerials depict contributing resources on the subject parcel. Have those since been demolished? Also, we will need to see design drawings and any available renderings for the new construction.

Other Board Comments:

- Provide a rendering from the view of the parking lot.
- Provide more detail on the pedestrian spaces and gathering spaces.
- Show where the use of Flemish bonds will be used.
- Provide enlarged elevations to see more detail.
- Consider the placement of the building given that the street grid is skewed since there are pinch points especially when considering phase II.
- Prioritize the placement of the gables and eliminate the ones that aren't working with the façade as a whole.
- Consider methods to break up the interior courtyard façade.
- Study the entry at the courtyard side and explore other options that are more welcoming and aesthetically pleasing.
- At the study areas, consider the massing and color of the curtain wall system as it looks disjointed from the first floor.

Motion to Approve pending resolution of any DHR comments: Anne Smith

Second: Stanley Rayfield

Vote: 6-Y 0-N

4.0 ANNOUNCEMENTS

The next AARB meeting will be held on Friday, November 1, 2024.

5.0 MEETING ADJOURNED – 3:07 pm